

# Therapeutic Alliance Between Bereaved Parents and Physicians in the PICU

**OBJECTIVES:** Therapeutic alliance is the collaborative bond that develops between patients/families and healthcare providers. Our objective is to determine the extent of therapeutic alliance bereaved parents perceive to have occurred with their child's physicians during their child's PICU stay, and associated factors.

**DESIGN:** Multicenter observational study.

**SETTING:** Eight children's hospitals affiliated with the Collaborative Pediatric Critical Care Research Network.

**PATIENTS:** Parents greater than or equal to 18 years old whose child died in a PICU (including cardiac ICU).

**INTERVENTIONS:** Bereaved parents completed the Human Connection Scale, a 16-item measure of therapeutic alliance, 6 months after their child's death. Human Connection Scale scores range from 16 to 64 with higher scores indicating greater alliance. Parents provided sociodemographic data, and medical records were reviewed for the child's clinical characteristics.

**MEASUREMENTS AND MAIN RESULTS:** Two-hundred and thirty-three parents of 157 deceased children responded to the Human Connection Scale with greater than or equal to 80% item completion. Among parents, 146 (62.7%) were female, 155 (66.5%) were White and 46 (19.7%) were Black, 175 (75.1%) were married, and 209 (89.7%) had at least a high-school education. Among children, median age at the time of death was 5.9 years (interquartile range, 0.64–13.9 yr) and 114 (72.6%) died after limitation or withdrawal of life support. Mean Human Connection Scale score was  $51.4 \pm 11.1$  for all parents,  $52.6 \pm 9.0$  for White parents, and  $47.0 \pm 13.7$  for Black parents. In multivariable modeling predicting Human Connection Scale scores, race was the only parent or child characteristic in the final model. Human Connection Scale scores were significantly different ( $-4.56$ ; 95% CI,  $-8.53$  to  $-0.6$ ;  $p = 0.025$ ) between the Black and White parents with items about trust, care, and honest communication showing the greatest mean difference.

**CONCLUSIONS:** Among parents bereaved in the PICU, therapeutic alliance with physicians is moderately high. Future research should identify strategies to strengthen therapeutic alliance with Black parents and examine the role of alliance on bereaved parents' health outcomes.

**KEY WORDS:** bereavement; child; parent; pediatric intensive care unit; physician; race; therapeutic alliance

Markita Suttle, MD<sup>1</sup>

Mark W. Hall, MD<sup>1</sup>

Murray M. Pollack, MD<sup>2</sup>

Robert A. Berg, MD<sup>3</sup>

Patrick S. McQuillen, MD<sup>4</sup>

Peter M. Mourani, MD<sup>5</sup>

Anil Sapru, MD<sup>6</sup>

Joseph A. Carcillo, MD<sup>7</sup>

Emily Startup, MS<sup>8</sup>

Richard Holubkov, PhD<sup>8</sup>

J. Michael Dean, MD<sup>8</sup>

Daniel A. Notterman, MD<sup>9</sup>

Kathleen L. Meert, MD<sup>10,11</sup>

for the *Eunice Kennedy Shriver National Institute of Child Health and Human Development Collaborative Pediatric Critical Care Research Network (CPCCRN)*

Approximately 43,000 children die annually in the United States, affecting the health and wellbeing of many families (1). Childhood death often gives rise to an intense grief among parents. Bereaved parents are at high risk of disorders such as complicated grief, anxiety, depression,

Copyright © 2020 by the Society of Critical Care Medicine and the World Federation of Pediatric Intensive and Critical Care Societies

DOI: 10.1097/PCC.0000000000002585

post-traumatic stress, insomnia, substance abuse, and physical morbidity (2–6). Complicated grief, a persistent and impairing form of grief, has been suggested to occur in as many as 60% of bereaved parents 6 months after their child's death in a PICU and persist in 40% at 18 months (7, 8). A little is known about interventions to prevent these health outcomes in bereaved parents, and even less is known about the role PICU physicians may play in bereaved parents' ability to adjust to their child's death.

Therapeutic alliance is a multifaceted construct, reflecting the strength and quality of the relationship between a patient and their physician or, in the case of pediatrics, parents and their child's physician (9). Elements of therapeutic alliance include a mutual sense of trust, care, respect, collaboration, and understanding. Therapeutic alliance was first described in the psychotherapy literature as an empathic bond between the patient and the therapist and is considered a key aspect of successful psychotherapy for both adults and children (10–12). Therapeutic alliance has demonstrated benefits in many serious childhood disorders including anorexia nervosa, autism, obsessive compulsive disorder, cancer, and arthritis (13–17), although it has not been well studied in pediatric critical illness. In adult ICUs, alliance between informal caregivers and physicians has been shown to be strongly correlated with patient-centeredness and poorly correlated with psychologic distress among caregivers (18). In adult oncology settings, caregiver-physician alliance has been associated with better caregiver experiences with their relative's end-of-life care (19), and patient-physician alliance has been associated with better mental health among caregivers during bereavement (20).

Parents facing their child's death in the PICU often rely on their child's healthcare providers for support and guidance. Needs of bereaved parents in PICUs include compassion, trust, honest communication, and respect (21–23); all of these are attributes of therapeutic alliance. The extent of therapeutic alliance and factors that affect therapeutic alliance between parents and physicians near the time of a child's death in the PICU are not well understood. The aim of this study is to determine the extent of therapeutic alliance that bereaved parents perceive to have occurred with their child's physicians during the child's PICU stay. We hypothesized that the extent of therapeutic alliance reported by parents may be influenced by

parent and/or child attributes and characteristics of the child's clinical course.

## MATERIALS AND METHODS

### Design and Setting

This multisite observational study was conducted across eight children's hospitals affiliated with the *Eunice Kennedy Shriver* National Institute of Child Health and Human Development Collaborative Pediatric Critical Care Research Network (CPCCRN) between September 2016 and March 2019. The study was approved by the University of Utah Institutional Review Board (IRB), serving as a central IRB for the CPCCRN.

### Participants

Parents, defined as biological parents and/or legal guardians, were eligible for participation if their child died in a PICU (including cardiac ICU), were English or Spanish speaking, and at least 18 years old. One or more parents of each deceased child were eligible to participate. Medical records of the deceased children were reviewed to obtain parents' contact information and primary language for the purpose of recruitment.

### Data Collection

Eligible parents were mailed surveys in English or Spanish 6 months after their child's death. If completed surveys were not returned within 1 month, telephone contact was attempted to offer the parents the option of completing the survey by telephone. If the household was successfully contacted by telephone but the survey was not completed, the parent was categorized as a refusal to participate. If the household could not be contacted by telephone after three or more attempts, the parent was categorized as unable to contact. For parents who completed surveys, their deceased child's medical records were further reviewed to collect information about the child's characteristics and clinical course. All parent information was collected by self-report.

### Outcomes

The primary outcome was the extent of therapeutic alliance as assessed by the Human Connection Scale

(HCS) (9). The HCS is a 16-item measure originally designed to evaluate therapeutic alliance between adult cancer patients and oncologists. The scale assesses: 1) physician understanding of patient concerns, 2) mutual caring and respect, 3) patient understanding of information, 4) patient trust in physician, and 5) collaboration. Cronbach  $\alpha$  has been reported as 0.9 and validity demonstrated by positive association with related measures including acceptance of terminal illness (9). For this study, the HCS was adapted to evaluate therapeutic alliance between bereaved parents and their child's PICU physicians by changing the phrase "your doctor" to "your child's doctor(s) in the ICU." Responses are reported on a 4-point scale (1 = Not at all, 4 = A great deal). Summed scores range from 16 to 64; higher scores indicate greater therapeutic alliance.

### Independent Variables

Independent variables included parental sociodemographics and attachment style, and child clinical characteristics. Parental sociodemographics included gender, age, race, ethnicity, marital status, education, relationship to the deceased child, and number of surviving children. Relationship to the deceased child was categorized as biological parent or other legal guardian.

Parental attachment style was assessed using the Revised Adult Attachment Scale (Revised-AAS)—Close Relationship Version (24, 25). The Revised-AAS is an 18-item measure that evaluates an individual's general orientation to close relationships. Cronbach  $\alpha$  has been reported to range from 0.768 to 0.855 across subscales (25), and validity demonstrated by positive association with related measures (26). Responses are reported on a 5-point scale ranging from 1 (not at all like me) to 5 (very much like me). Scoring was performed to obtain subscale scores along two dimensions of attachment: avoidance and anxiety (24). Scores for attachment-related avoidance and anxiety are a mean of the relevant items and range from 1 to 5. Higher scores indicate more avoidance or anxiety, respectively, whereas lower scores indicate less avoidance or anxiety and, thus, more secure attachment.

Child clinical characteristics included gender, age at time of death, cause of death, trajectory of death, mode of death, and PICU and hospital lengths of stay. Cause of death was categorized as cardiac, respiratory, malignancy, sepsis/multiple organ failure, neurologic, trauma, or other. Mode of death was categorized as

limitation/withdrawal of life support, brain death, or unsuccessful cardiopulmonary resuscitation (CPR). Trajectory of death was categorized as sudden unexpected death, death from a potentially curable disease, death from a lethal congenital anomaly, or death from a progressive condition with intermittent crises (27).

### Statistical Analysis

For the HCS and Revised-AAS measures, scores were calculated based on available data if at least 80% of the items in each measure were completed. For the HCS score, which is a sum of the responses to each of 16 items, the total sum of completed item responses was multiplied by 16 and divided by the total number of items completed. For the Revised-AAS score, which is a mean of 18 items, the mean of the completed items was determined. If less than 80% of items were completed for either measure, the score was considered missing. Individuals with missing HCS scores were excluded from all analyses.

Data are summarized using frequencies and percentages for categorical variables, and means, SDs, medians, interquartile ranges (IQRs), minimums, and maximums for continuous variables. To account for the fact that more than one parent of the same deceased child could participate in the study, and the characteristics and survey scores of the parents of the same child are likely correlated, linear mixed models were used with child as the random effect to identify variables associated with HCS scores. Candidate variables were determined by univariable linear mixed models. It was predetermined that variables with a  $p$  value of less than or equal to 0.2 in the univariable analyses would be candidate predictors for the model selection. To construct the final model, manual backward selection was performed on the multivariable mixed model containing the candidate predictors until all remaining predictors had a  $p$  value of less than or equal to 0.1.

## RESULTS

Surveys were mailed to 710 families 6 months after their child's death. One or more parents from 159 families (22.4%) responded to the survey, 181 families (25.5%) refused, and 370 (52.1%) could not be contacted. In total, 237 parents responded to the survey; two were later found to be ineligible, because their child died in a location other than a PICU.

Of the remaining 235 parents, 200 (85.1%) responded in English by mail, 22 (9.4%) in English by telephone, 10 (4.3%) in Spanish by mail, and three (1.3%) in Spanish by telephone. Surveys were returned by mail or completed by telephone a median of 7.6 months (IQR, 6.9–8.8 mo) after the death. Two parents were excluded from all analyses, because less than 80% of HCS items were completed. There were 14 parents for whom the HCS was scored in the presence of missing data. Of these, seven were missing one response, six were missing two responses, and one was missing three responses. The final data set included 233 parents of 157 deceased children.

Of the 233 included parents, 146 (62.7%) were female, 155 (66.5%) were White and 46 (19.7%) Black, 175 (75.1%) were married, and 209 (89.7%) had at least a high-school education (**Table 1**). Two-hundred and fifteen (92.3%) were biological parents and 42 (18.0%) had lost their only child. Mean HCS score was  $51.4 \pm 11.1$ . Revised-AAS avoidance score was  $2.6 \pm 0.7$  and anxiety score was  $2.1 \pm 1.0$ .

Of 157 deceased children, 86 (54.8%) were male and median age at the time of death was 5.9 years (IQR, 0.64–13.9 yr) (**Table 2**). Cause of death was cardiac for 40 (25.5%), sepsis or multiple organ failure for 30 (19.1%), neurologic for 25 (15.9%), and respiratory for 24 (15.3%). Trajectory of death was sudden and unexpected for 48 (30.6%). Mode of death was limitation or withdrawal of life support for 114 (72.6%), brain death for 24 (15.3%), and unsuccessful CPR for 19 (12.1%). Median PICU length of stay was 6.6 days (IQR, 2.2–21.8 d), and hospital length of stay was 8.7 days (IQR, 2.4–35.0 d).

Based on univariable analyses, the following characteristics were candidate predictors of parental HCS scores (**Supplemental Digital Content 1**, <http://links.lww.com/PCC/B559>): parent race ( $p = 0.062$ ), child trajectory of death ( $p = 0.124$ ), child mode of death ( $p = 0.113$ ), and hospital length of stay ( $p = 0.122$ ). Backward selection resulted in a simple mixed model with parent race as the only predictor (**Table 3**). HCS scores were significantly different ( $-4.56$ ; 95% CI,  $-8.53$  to  $-0.6$ ;  $p = 0.025$ ) between the Black and White parents. HCS items about trust, care, and honest communication showed the greatest mean difference between the Black and White parents (**Table 4**). Items about coping and offering of hope were among the lowest scored for all parents.

**TABLE 1.**  
Characteristics of Bereaved Parents Whose Child Died in a PICU

Characteristic	Overall ( $n = 233$ )
Gender, $n$ (%)	
Male	87 (37.3)
Female	146 (62.7)
Age (yr)	
Mean (sd)	38.5 (10.41)
Median (IQR)	37.0 (30.7–46.1)
Race, $n$ (%)	
White/Caucasian	155 (66.5)
Black	46 (19.7)
Asian	5 (2.1)
American Indian/Alaskan Native	3 (1.3)
Native Hawaiian or other Pacific Islander	0 (0)
More than one race	3 (1.3)
Other	16 (6.9)
Not reported	5 (2.1)
Ethnicity, $n$ (%)	
Hispanic or Latino	35 (15.0)
Non-Hispanic or Latino	192 (82.4)
Not provided	6 (2.6)
Education, $n$ (%)	
Some high school or less	22 (9.4)
High-school graduate or general education diploma	60 (25.8)
Vocational school or some college	64 (27.5)
College degree or higher	85 (36.5)
Not provided	2 (0.9)
Marital status, $n$ (%)	
Married	175 (75.1)
Single	56 (24.0)
Not provided	2 (0.9)

(Continued)

**TABLE 1. (Continued).**  
**Characteristics of Bereaved Parents Whose Child Died in a PICU**

Characteristic	Overall (n = 233)
Relation to child, n (%)	
Biological parent	215 (92.3)
Other guardian	18 (7.7)
Additional children, n (%)	
None	42 (18.0)
One	78 (33.5)
Two	50 (21.5)
Three or more	62 (26.6)
Not provided	1 (0.4)
Revised-AAS Avoidance Score <sup>a</sup>	
Mean (sd)	2.6 (0.73)
Median (IQR)	2.7 (2.1–3.2)
Min, max	1.0, 4.6
Revised-AAS Anxiety Score <sup>b</sup>	
Mean (sd)	2.1 (1.00)
Median (IQR)	1.8 (1.2–2.7)
Min, max	1.0, 5.0
Human Connection Scale Score <sup>c</sup>	
Mean (sd)	51.4 (11.09)
Min, max	16.0, 64.0

IQR = interquartile range, AAS = Adult Attachment Scale.

<sup>a-c</sup>Value is mean of item responses.

Parent characteristics were obtained by self-report.

## DISCUSSION

Our study is the first to evaluate therapeutic alliance between the parents of children who died in a PICU and their deceased child's PICU physicians, and explore parent and child characteristics associated with therapeutic alliance. The extent of therapeutic alliance reported by bereaved parents, on average, appears to be moderately high although individual scores varied widely. Therapeutic alliance for Black parents was lower than that for White parents with the greatest

**TABLE 2.**  
**Characteristics of Children Who Died in a PICU**

Characteristic	Overall (n = 157)
Gender, n (%)	
Male	86 (54.8)
Female	71 (45.2)
Age at time of death (yr)	
Mean (sd)	8.0 (7.77)
Median (IQR)	5.9 (0.64–13.9)
Min, max	0.0, 38.7
Trajectory of death, n (%)	
Sudden unexpected death	48 (30.6)
Death from progressive condition with intermittent crises	44 (28.0)
Death from potentially curable disease	36 (22.9)
Death from a congenital anomaly	29 (18.5)
Mode of death, n (%)	
Limitation or withdrawal of life support	114 (72.6)
Brain death	24 (15.3)
Failed cardiopulmonary resuscitation	19 (12.1)
Cause of death, n (%)	
Cardiac	40 (25.5)
Sepsis or multiple organ failure	30 (19.1)
Neurologic	25 (15.9)
Respiratory	24 (15.3)
Trauma	20 (12.7)
Malignancy	13 (8.3)
Other	5 (3.2)
PICU length of stay (d)	
Mean (sd)	22.3 (39.02)
Median (IQR)	6.6 (2.1–21.8)
Min, max	0.0, 209.2
Hospital length of stay (d)	
Mean (sd)	27.4 (42.50)
Median (IQR)	8.7 (2.4–35.0)
Min, max	0.1, 209.2

IQR = interquartile range.

Child characteristics were obtained by medical record review.

**TABLE 3.**  
**Final Model of Predictors of the Human Connection Scale Scores**

Characteristic <sup>a</sup>	Estimate (95% CI)	<i>p</i> <sup>b</sup>	<i>p</i> <sup>c</sup>
Parent race			
White/Caucasian	Reference		0.0617
Black	-4.56 (-8.53 to -0.60)	0.025	
Other <sup>d</sup>	0.25 (-3.73 to 4.22)	0.90	

<sup>a</sup>*n* = 215; parents with missing data for any variable were excluded.

<sup>b</sup>*p* value comparing Black/African American with reference or Other to reference.

<sup>c</sup>*p* value for multivariable mixed model.

<sup>d</sup>The category Other collapses all races except White/Caucasian and Black due to small sample size.

differences in the areas of trust, care, and honest communication. Medical mistrust and poor communication have been described as factors contributing to racial differences in parental decision-making during pediatric end-of-life care (28–31).

Medical mistrust is well documented among Black Americans and likely rooted in American history (32–34). Lasting effects of prior atrocities from personal or learned experiences remain today and are linked to disparities in preventative healthcare (35, 36), treatment adherence (37, 38), and patient satisfaction (39). Black parents have reported decreased trust in physicians caring for their children (40). Research suggests that trust in physicians improves among Black parents when there is greater continuity of care and use of a partnership-building communication style (41).

Poor medical communication may be another barrier to therapeutic alliance between Black Americans and physicians, further perpetuating feelings of mistrust and discrimination (41–43). High-quality communication during clinical encounters may improve health outcomes regardless of race or ethnicity (44). In a study of breastfeeding promotion, Black mothers voiced their desire for personal connection with healthcare providers and preferred providers who would listen, empathize, and offer encouragement (45). A study by October et al (46), which

included a high percentage of Black parents (64%) in the PICU, demonstrated that parent-provider interactions with more patient-centeredness, such as a higher proportion of empathetic statements, question asking, and emotional talk, positively influenced parent satisfaction despite the severity of their child's illness. Perhaps pediatric intensivists who use patient-centered communication will have more success at establishing stronger alliances with Black parents, although this warrants further investigation within the PICU.

Perceived discrimination is another barrier to therapeutic alliance reported by Black Americans (43, 47, 48). The HCS measure used in our study does not include items about discrimination per se; therefore, it is unknown whether bereaved parents perceived discrimination from PICU physicians. Prior research suggests that perceptions of discrimination, mistrust, and poor communication by Black Americans are interrelated (43). Black Americans have perceived discrimination when their symptoms or problems were dismissed, when they felt disrespected, or when their perspectives were not acknowledged during clinical encounters (43). Conversely, perceived discrimination can be minimized and therapeutic alliance strengthened when providers develop multicultural competence, express a belief in equality and empowerment, and demonstrate empathy, positive regard, and genuineness (49).

Other parent and child characteristics evaluated in our study were not significantly associated with therapeutic alliance. Attachment represents the basic framework characterizing how a person thinks, feels, and behaves in close personal relationships (50). Two fundamental dimensions of attachment are avoidance and anxiety. Individuals with high attachment-related avoidance tend to have a negative view of others and prefer not to rely on others. Those with high attachment-related anxiety tend to have a negative self-image and worry that others will not be available to them. Individuals low on avoidance and low on anxiety have more secure attachment and are more comfortable being close to others, depending on others, and having others dependent on them. We evaluated the association between parent attachment and therapeutic alliance, because prior research on adult patient-provider relationships suggests that some patients attribute attachment functions to healthcare providers and that a patient's dissatisfaction with a provider may be

**TABLE 4.**  
**The Human Connection Scale Items: Responses for Black and White Parents**

No. of Items	Item	All Parents <sup>a</sup> (n = 215), Mean (SD)	White <sup>a</sup> (n = 150), Mean (SD)	Black <sup>a</sup> (N = 38) Mean (SD)
1	How often would you say your child's doctor(s) took the time to listen to your concerns in the ICU?	3.4 (0.80)	3.5 (0.73) <sup>b</sup>	3.1 (0.96) <sup>b</sup>
2	To what extent did your child's doctor(s) pay close attention to what you were saying?	3.4 (0.85)	3.5 (0.77)	3.0 (1.01)
3	To what extent do you think your child's doctor(s) saw your child as a whole person in the ICU?	3.4 (0.81)	3.5 (0.77)	3.2 (0.94)
4	How much did you like your child's doctor(s) in the ICU?	3.3 (0.90)	3.4 (0.80)	2.9 (1.14)
5	How much did you trust your child's doctor(s) in the ICU?	3.4 (0.89)	3.5 (0.74)	2.9 (1.13)
6	How thorough was your child's doctor(s) in the ICU?	3.4 (0.76)	3.5 (0.68)	3.1 (0.84)
7	How much did you respect your child's doctor(s) in the ICU?	3.5 (0.76)	3.6 (0.64)	3.2 (1.02)
8	How much did you feel your child's doctor(s) cared about your child in the ICU?	3.4 (0.82)	3.6 (0.72)	3.0 (0.97)
9	How much of the time would you say your doctor(s) was honest with you in the ICU?	3.4 (0.84)	3.5 (0.75)	2.9 (1.02)
10	To what extent did you feel comfortable asking the doctor(s) questions in the ICU?	3.5 (0.77)	3.6 (0.69)	3.3 (1.00)
11	How often did you understand the doctor's explanations and suggestions in the ICU?	3.3 (0.78)	3.4 (0.73)	2.9 (0.94)
12	How often did your doctor(s) ask how family members were coping with your child's illness or health condition?	2.5 (0.99)	2.4 (0.90)	2.4 (1.15)
13	How often did your child's doctor(s) offer hope in the ICU?	2.5 (1.00)	2.4 (0.92)	2.5 (1.08)
14	How often did the doctor(s) ask how you were coping with your child's illness or health condition?	2.7 (0.98)	2.6 (0.94)	2.8 (1.01)
15	How concerned do you think your doctor(s) was about your child's quality of life?	3.3 (0.83)	3.4 (0.78)	3.0 (0.97)
16	How open-minded do you feel your child's ICU doctor(s) was?	3.1 (0.96)	3.1 (0.92)	2.8 (1.13)

<sup>a</sup>Scores are from parents included in the multivariable mixed model.

<sup>b</sup>Item response format is as follows: 1 = Not at all; 2 = Somewhat; 3 = Quite a bit; 4 = A great deal.

influenced by attachment insecurity (51). We expected that parents with more secure attachment would report greater therapeutic alliance with their child's physicians although this was not observed. Similarly, characteristics of the child's death such as cause, trajectory, or mode of death were not significantly associated with alliance.

Whether therapeutic alliance between the bereaved parents and PICU physicians has a positive impact on parents' bereavement experiences is not well understood; however, prior research suggests that parents have many informational, emotional, and other needs near the time of their child's death and often rely on their child's healthcare providers to help meet these

needs (21, 22). HSC items reflecting physician inquiries about parent and family coping, and the offering of hope were scored lowest by parents suggesting these needs were not well met. Future research should investigate relationships between therapeutic alliance and bereaved parents' health outcomes, as well as the influence of race on these relationships.

Strengths of this study include the multicenter design and racial, ethnic, and geographic diversity of the participants. Limitations include the low response rate; however, this is typical of parental bereavement research and likely due to bereavement-related distress and the burden of research participation (2, 3, 6–8, 22, 23). This study was part of a larger project on parental health outcomes during bereavement, and no formal power analysis was performed for the outcome of therapeutic alliance. Parents with strong alliances with physicians may have had greater motivation to participate and may be overrepresented in the research. Alternatively, parents with strained relationships may have been more likely to participate as a means of providing feedback. Parents who participated were more often married and more highly educated than the general U.S. population. These factors limit the generalizability of our findings. Characteristics of nonresponders, such as race, are unknown, because only parental inclusion criteria and contact information were obtained from the medical records of children whose parents did not participate. The HCS scale was developed and validated for use with adult cancer patients and their oncologists, and adapted for use with PICU physicians. Parents likely interacted with several intensivists and subspecialists during their child's PICU stay; hence, their responses may indicate a general sense of alliance rather than alliance with any specific provider. Therefore, the extent to which parents' perceptions of alliance relate to the intensivist, other specific provider, or the team as a whole is unknown. Parents completed the HCS approximately 6 months after their child's death, and recall bias may have influenced their responses. Parents' perceptions of therapeutic alliance likely depend not only on the parent and child characteristics but also on the characteristics of the physician with whom the alliance is formed. Physician characteristics and their perceptions of therapeutic alliance were not assessed. Specifically, the extent to which racial discordance between the parents and physicians contributed to parents' assessments of alliance was not evaluated.

## CONCLUSIONS

Therapeutic alliance between bereaved parents and PICU physicians is moderately high; however, it is lower for Black parents than White parents. Future research should identify strategies to strengthen therapeutic alliance with Black parents, as well as examine the role of therapeutic alliance on bereaved parents' health outcomes.

## ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank Whit Coleman, MSRA, BSN, RN, CCRC, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, UT; Stephanie Dorton, BSN, RN, CCRP, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, UT; Nael Abdelsamad, MD, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, UT; Kylee Arbogast, BS, RN, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, UT; Kristi Flick, BS, MPH, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, UT; Ann Pawluszka, BSN, RN, Children's Hospital of Michigan, Detroit, MI; Melanie Lulic, BS, Children's Hospital of Michigan, Detroit, MI; Carolann Twelves, RN, BSN, CCRC, Children's Hospital of Philadelphia, Philadelphia, PA; Mary Ann DiLiberto, BS, RN, CCRC, Children's Hospital of Philadelphia, Philadelphia, PA; Elyse Tomanio, BSN, RN, Children's National Medical Center, Washington, DC; Katherine Stone, Children's National Medical Center, Washington, DC; Kathryn Malone, Children's Hospital Colorado, Aurora, CO; Diane Ladell, MPH, CCRC, Children's Hospital Colorado, Aurora, CO; Ruth Grosskreuz, MD, CCRC, Children's Hospital Colorado, Aurora, CO; Lisa Steele, RN, BSN, CCRC, CCRN, Nationwide Children's Hospital, Columbus, OH; Maggie Flowers, BSN, Nationwide Children's Hospital, Columbus, OH; Anna Ratiu, MPH, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, CA; Tanaya Deshmukh, MS, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, CA; Anne McKenzie, BSN, CCRN, University of California, San Francisco, San Francisco, CA; Yensy Zetino, University of California, San Francisco, San Francisco, CA; and Leighann Koch, BS, BSN, RN, University of Pittsburgh Medical Center, Pittsburgh, PA.

1 Department of Pediatrics, Nationwide Children's Hospital, Columbus, OH.

2 Department of Pediatrics, Children's National Hospital, Washington, DC.

3 Department of Anesthesiology and Critical Care Medicine, Children's Hospital of Philadelphia, Philadelphia, PA.



- 4 Department of Pediatrics, Benioff Children's Hospital, University of California, San Francisco, San Francisco, CA.
- 5 Department of Pediatrics, Children's Hospital of Colorado, University of Colorado School of Medicine, Aurora, CO.
- 6 Department of Pediatrics, Mattel Children's Hospital, University of California, Los Angeles, Los Angeles, CA.
- 7 Department of Critical Care Medicine, Children's Hospital of Pittsburgh, University of Pittsburgh Medical Center, Pittsburgh, PA.
- 8 Department of Pediatrics, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, UT.
- 9 Department of Molecular Biology, Princeton University, Princeton, NJ.
- 10 Department of Pediatrics, Children's Hospital of Michigan, Detroit, MI.
- 11 Central Michigan University, Mt. Pleasant, MI.

5. Brooten D, Youngblut JM, Roche RM, et al: Acute illnesses, use of health services, and changes in medication among parents after infant or child death. *Am J Crit Care* 2019; 28:193–201
6. Brooten D, Youngblut JM, Caicedo C, et al: Parents' acute illnesses, hospitalizations, and medication changes during the difficult first year after infant or child NICU/PICU death. *Am J Hosp Palliat Care* 2018; 35:75–82
7. Meert KL, Donaldson AE, Newth CJ, et al; Eunice Kennedy Shriver National Institute of Child Health and Human Development Collaborative Pediatric Critical Care Research Network: Complicated grief and associated risk factors among parents following a child's death in the pediatric intensive care unit. *Arch Pediatr Adolesc Med* 2010; 164:1045–1051
8. Meert KL, Shear K, Newth CJ, et al; Eunice Kennedy Shriver National Institute of Child Health and Human Development Collaborative Pediatric Critical Care Research Network: Follow-up study of complicated grief among parents eighteen months after a child's death in the pediatric intensive care unit. *J Palliat Med* 2011; 14:207–214
9. Mack JW, Block SD, Nilsson M, et al: Measuring therapeutic alliance between oncologists and patients with advanced cancer: The Human Connection Scale. *Cancer* 2009; 115:3302–3311
10. Horvath AO, Luborsky L: The role of the therapeutic alliance in psychotherapy. *J Consult Clin Psychol* 1993; 61:561–573
11. Flückiger C, Del Re AC, Wampold BE, et al: The alliance in adult psychotherapy: A meta-analytic synthesis. *Psychotherapy (Chic)* 2018; 55:316–340
12. Karver MS, De Nadai AS, Monahan M, et al: Meta-analysis of the prospective relation between alliance and outcome in child and adolescent psychotherapy. *Psychotherapy (Chic)* 2018; 55:341–355
13. Sibeoni J, Verneuil L, Poulmarc'h L, et al: Obstacles and facilitators of therapeutic alliance among adolescents with anorexia nervosa, their parents and their psychiatrists: A qualitative study. *Clin Child Psychol Psychiatry* 2020; 25:16–32
14. Klebanoff SM, Rosenau KA, Wood JJ: The therapeutic alliance in cognitive-behavioral therapy for school-aged children with autism and clinical anxiety. *Autism* 2019; 23:2031–2042
15. Keeley ML, Geffken GR, Ricketts E, et al: The therapeutic alliance in the cognitive behavioral treatment of pediatric obsessive-compulsive disorder. *J Anxiety Disord* 2011; 25: 855–863
16. Spinetta JJ, Jankovic M, Masera G, et al: Optimal care for the child with cancer: A summary statement from the SIOP Working Committee on psychosocial issues in pediatric oncology. *Pediatr Blood Cancer* 2009; 52:904–907
17. White M, Stinson JN, Lingley-Pottie P, et al: Exploring therapeutic alliance with an internet-based self-management program with brief telephone support for youth with arthritis: A pilot study. *Telemed J E Health* 2012; 18:271–276
18. Huff NG, Nadig N, Ford DW, et al: Therapeutic alliance between the caregivers of critical illness survivors and intensive care unit clinicians. *Ann Am Thorac Soc* 2015; 12:1646–1653

Supplemental digital content is available for this article. Direct URL citations appear in the printed text and are provided in the HTML and PDF versions of this article on the journal's website (<http://journals.lww.com/pccmjjournal>).

Supported, in part, by the following cooperative agreements from the Eunice Kennedy Shriver National Institute of Child Health and Human Development: UG1HD083170, UG1HD049981, UG1HD63108, UG1HD083166, UG1HD083171, UG1HD049983, U01HD049934, and UG1HD050096.

Drs. Suttle's, Hall's, Pollack's, Berg's, McQuillen's, Mourani's, Sapru's, Carcillo's, Holubkov's, Dean's, and Meert's institutions received funding from the National Institutes of Health (NIH), and they received support for article research from the NIH. Dr. Hall received funding from La Jolla Pharmaceuticals. Dr. Startup disclosed work for hire. Dr. Holubkov received funding from Pfizer, Revance, Physicians Committee for Responsible Medicine, Medimmune, and Direct Corporation. Dr. Notterman disclosed that he does not have any potential conflicts of interest.

For information regarding this article, E-mail: [meert1kl@cmich.edu](mailto:meert1kl@cmich.edu)

## REFERENCES

1. Kochanek KD, Murphy SL, Xu JQ, et al: Deaths: Final Data for 2017. National Vital Statistics Reports; Vol 68. Hyattsville, MD, National Center for Health Statistics, 2019. Available at: <https://stacks.cdc.gov/view/cdc/79486>. Accessed September 30, 2020
2. Pohlkamp L, Kreicbergs U, Sveen J: Bereaved mothers' and fathers' prolonged grief and psychological health 1 to 5 years after loss—a nationwide study. *Psychooncology* 2019; 28:1530–1536
3. Lykke C, Ekholm O, Schmiegelow K, et al: Anxiety and depression in bereaved parents after losing a child due to life-limiting diagnoses: A Danish Nationwide Questionnaire Survey. *J Pain Symptom Manage* 2019; 58:596–604
4. Dias N, Brandon D, Haase JE, et al: Bereaved parents' health status during the first 6 months after their child's death. *Am J Hosp Palliat Care* 2018; 35:829–839

19. An AW, Ladwig S, Epstein RM, et al: The impact of the caregiver-oncologist relationship on caregiver experiences of end-of-life care and bereavement outcomes. *Support Care Cancer* 2020; 28:4219–4225
20. Trevino KM, Maciejewski PK, Epstein AS, et al: The lasting impact of the therapeutic alliance: Patient-oncologist alliance as a predictor of caregiver bereavement adjustment. *Cancer* 2015; 121:3534–3542
21. Meert KL, Briller SH, Schim SM, et al: Examining the needs of bereaved parents in the pediatric intensive care unit: A qualitative study. *Death Stud* 2009; 33:712–740
22. Meert KL, Templin TN, Michelson KN, et al: The bereaved parent needs assessment: A new instrument to assess the needs of parents whose children died in the pediatric intensive care unit. *Crit Care Med* 2012; 40:3050–3057
23. Baughcum AE, Fortney CA, Winning AM, et al: Healthcare satisfaction and unmet needs among bereaved parents in the NICU. *Adv Neonatal Care* 2020; 20:118–126
24. Collins NL: Working models of attachment: Implications for explanation, emotion and behavior. *J Pers Soc Psychol* 1996; 71:810–832
25. Graham JM, Unterschute MS: A reliability generalization meta-analysis of self report measures of adult attachment. *J Pers Assess* 2014; 25:1–11
26. Ravitz P, Maunder R, Hunter J, et al: Adult attachment measures: A 25-year review. *J Psychosom Res* 2010; 69:419–432
27. Institute of Medicine: *When Children Die: Improving Palliative and End-of-Life Care for Children and Their Families*. Washington, DC, The National Academies Press, 2003
28. Moseley KL, Church A, Hempel B, et al: End-of-life choices for African-American and White infants in a neonatal intensive-care unit: A pilot study. *J Natl Med Assoc* 2004; 96:933–937
29. Tucker Edmonds B, Fager C, Srinivas S, et al: Racial and ethnic differences in use of intubation for periviable neonates. *Pediatrics* 2011; 127:e1120–e1127
30. Harris VC, Links AR, Walsh J, et al: A systematic review of race/ethnicity and parental treatment decision-making. *Clin Pediatr (Phila)* 2018; 57:1453–1464
31. Fry JT, Matoba N, Datta A, et al: Children's Hospital Neonatal Consortium (CHNC): Center, gestational age, and race impact end-of-life care practices at regional neonatal intensive care units. *J Pediatr* 2020; 217:86–91.e1
32. Byrd WM, Clayton LA: *An American Health Dilemma: A Medical History of African Americans and the Problem of Race*. New York, NY, Routledge, 2002
33. Fett S: *Working Cures: Healing, Health, and Power on Southern Slave Plantations*. Chapel Hill, NC, University of North Carolina Press, 2002
34. Gamble VN: Under the shadow of Tuskegee: African Americans and health care. *Am J Public Health* 1997; 87:1773–1778
35. Powell W, Richmond J, Mohottige D, et al: Medical mistrust, racism, and delays in preventive health screening among African-American men. *Behav Med* 2019; 45:102–117
36. Sheppard VB, Mays D, LaVeist T, et al: Medical mistrust influences black women's level of engagement in BRCA ½ genetic counseling and testing. *J Natl Med Assoc* 2013; 105:17–22
37. Dale SK, Bogart LM, Wagner GJ, et al: Medical mistrust is related to lower longitudinal medication adherence among African-American males with HIV. *J Health Psychol* 2014; 15:1180–1186
38. Cuffee YL, Hargraves JL, Rosal M, et al: Reported racial discrimination, trust in physicians, and medication adherence among inner-city African Americans with hypertension. *Am J Public Health* 2013; 103:e55–e62
39. Moore AD, Hamilton JB, Knafelz GJ, et al: The influence of mistrust, racism, religious participation, and access to care on patient satisfaction for African American men: The North Carolina-Louisiana Prostate Cancer Project. *J Natl Med Assoc* 2013; 105:59–68
40. Moseley KL, Clark SJ, Gebremariam A, et al: Parents' trust in their child's physician: Using an adapted Trust in Physician Scale. *Ambul Pediatr* 2006; 6:58–61
41. Horn IB, Mitchell SJ, Wang J, et al: African-American parents' trust in their child's primary care provider. *Acad Pediatr* 2012; 12:399–404
42. Martin KD, Roter DL, Beach MC, et al: Physician communication behaviors and trust among black and white patients with hypertension. *Med Care* 2013; 51:151–157
43. Cuevas AG, O'Brien K, Saha S: African American experiences in healthcare: "I always feel like I'm getting skipped over". *Health Psychol* 2016; 35:987–995
44. Street RL Jr, Makoul G, Arora NK, et al: How does communication heal? Pathways linking clinician-patient communication to health outcomes. *Patient Educ Couns* 2009; 74:295–301
45. Cricco-Lizzo R. Black non-Hispanic mothers' perceptions about the promotion of infant-feeding methods by nurses and physicians. *J Obstet Gynecol Neonatal Nurs* 2006; 35:173–180
46. October TW, Hinds PS, Wang J, et al: Parent satisfaction with communication is associated with physician's patient-centered communication patterns during family conferences. *Pediatr Crit Care Med* 2016; 17:490–497
47. Abramson CM, Hashemi M, Sánchez-Jankowski M: Perceived discrimination in U.S. healthcare: Charting the effects of key social characteristics within and across racial groups. *Prev Med Rep* 2015; 2:615–621
48. Trent M, Dooley DG, Douge J, et al: The impact of racism on child and adolescent health. *Pediatrics* 2019; 144:e20191765
49. Davis TA, Ancis JR, Ashby JS: Therapist effects, working alliance, and African American women substance users. *Cultur Divers Ethnic Minor Psychol* 2015; 21:126–135
50. Slade A, Holmes J: Attachment and psychotherapy. *Curr Opin Psychol* 2019; 25:152–156
51. Maunder RG, Hunter JJ: Can patients be 'attached' to health-care providers? An observational study to measure attachment phenomena in patient-provider relationships. *BMJ Open* 2016; 6:e011068